

MINNESOTA Appendix

Key MINNESOTA Subsidy Programs

Program	Recent Annual Cost	Online Recipient Disclosure	Recipient Disclosure Score*
Business Development Public Infrastructure Grant Program -a funding stream for road infrastructure built primarily to benefit specific companies	\$7.9 million (FY 2012)	None	0/100
Job Opportunity Building Zones (JOBZ) -a controversial program allowing state and local tax subsidies for companies locating in special zones; criticized as ineffective, it has resulted in numerous clawbacks	\$37.2 million (FY 2012)	Source	80/100
Job Skills Partnership Program -a grant program that pays educational institutions to provide training for employees of specific companies	\$5.7 million (FY 2012)	Source	23/100
Minnesota Investment Fund -a cash-grant and loan program which subsidizes businesses creating manufacturing and technology-related jobs	\$3.8 million (FY 2012)	None	0/100
Research and Development Tax Credits -a tax credit program subsidizing companies for up to 10 percent of R&D expenditures; a handful of major corporations benefit the most from this subsidy, frequently wiping out between 20 and 60 percent of state corporate tax liabilities	\$66.8 million (FY 2012)	None	0/100
Average of Disclosure Scores for All Programs			21% (103/500)

*See next page for scoring details

Show Us the Subsidized Jobs: Scoring Details for MINNESOTA Programs		<i>Maximum possible score for category</i>	Business Development Public Infrastructure Grant Program	Job Opportunity Building Zones (JOBZ)	Job Skills Partnership Program	Minnesota Investment Fund	Research and Development Tax Credits
<i>Score criteria</i>							
Subsidy Value	BOTH amount approved AND actual amount disbursed/claimed (15) -	15	0	10	10	0	0
	Either amount approved OR actual amount disbursed/claimed (10) -or-						
	Performance-based with actual amount disbursed/claimed (15)						
Status of Award	Indication or whether award is completed, active, terminated (5)	15	0	15	0	0	0
	Disclosure of whether enforcement action taken (5)						
	Disclosure of amount clawed back or recalibrated or rescinded (5)						
Jobs Reporting	Number of jobs or training slots promised/projected ONLY (5) -or-	20	0	20	5	0	0
	Actual number of jobs created/retained or trainings ONLY (15) -or-						
	BOTH promised/projected and actual (20)						
Wages Reporting	Wage rates/payroll promised/projected only (10) -or-	20	0	20	0	0	0
	Actual wage rates/payroll only (15) -or-						
	Both promised and actual (18) -or-						
	Either promised and actual with wage disaggregation (20)						
Project Information	Location with street address (10)	15	0	15	0	0	0
	Indication whether the project is a relocation (3)						
	Project documents OR total subsidy package data (2)						
Company Information	DUNS or FEIN (2)	5	0	2	0	0	0
	NAICS (1)						
	Parent company (2)						
User Features	Ease of access (3)	10	0	3	8	0	0
	Multiple years of data (3)						
	Downloadable (2)						
	Part of or linked to a wider government transparency site (2)						
<i>Total before penalty</i>		100	0	85	23	0	0
<i>Penalty points (see reasoning on following page)</i>			0	-5	0	0	0
TOTAL PROGRAM SCORE			0	80	23	0	0

*See next page for notes on scoring

Minnesota Program Scoring Notes

Minnesota was once a pioneer in subsidy disclosure, but its current reporting system is difficult to use and outdated. One must navigate through a puzzling array of individual project reports arranged by award year, then report year, and finally by locality. These reports are unable to be searched by company name.

To find data on subsidies, one must click on the For Local Government tab of the www.mn.gov/deed website. Then one must click on Business Subsidy Reporting page. Only by clicking on the Annual Reports tab on the left can one navigate to the landing page for subsidy reporting. For some reason, clicking on the Annual Reports link on the body of the page returns you to the current page you are on. The page offers three options: JOBZ Reports, Non-JOBZ Business Assistance Reports, and Financial Assistance Reports. These links take users to various Report Activity links listed by years. Clicking on a particular year takes users to more years of Report Activity. This is obviously confusing and difficult to navigate. By clicking on this second level of annual Report Activity, users are directed to recipient data. But instead of being organized by the name of the recipient, they are organized by the city in which the subsidy was awarded.

We could not find information about recipients of the Business Development Public Infrastructure Grant program, the Minnesota Investment Fund, and the Research and Development Tax Credit program. These programs received no points for disclosure, despite the appearance of a comprehensive disclosure database.

Business Development Public Infrastructure Grant Program

There is no online recipient disclosure for this program.

Job Opportunity Building Zones (JOBZ)

<http://mn.gov/deed/government/business-subsidy/biz-subsidy-annuals/jobz/2013-jobz.jsp>

Points were awarded in the Project Information category for disclosing the entire subsidy package and in the Company Information category for disclosing the parent company. Within the User Features category, points were awarded for including multiple years of data. Clawback information about JOBZ recipients is listed under question 35 of the PDF form.

Unfortunately, we found using the database containing JOBZ information to be both confusing and difficult. Without an adequate search interface, it is difficult to find information about a specific recipient of subsidies. To access data about recipients, one must confusingly click through various years of awards and reporting. We found the database to be extremely limiting in this regard. Worse, many of these PDFs are illegible. As a result, we applied a penalty of five points to the scoring of this program.

Job Skills Partnership Program

<http://mn.gov/deed/programs-services/mjsp/funded/index.jsp>

<http://mn.gov/deed/programs-services/mjsp/data/>

The first link above contains a tab labeled as Funded Projects. Within the tab, recipient award amounts and projected job creation are listed. Data for the Job Skills Partnership Program may be downloaded at the second link listed above.

Minnesota Investment Fund

There is no online recipient disclosure for this program.

Research and Development Tax Credits

There is no online recipient disclosure for this program.